

QUICK LINKS:**Questions asked by Councillor Murdoch in North Ayrshire Council Meetings June 2018 - June 2019 regarding Peel Ports proposals for Oil Rig decommissioning at Hunterston**

| Date of Meeting | Questioner/ Respondent | Question |
|------------------------|------------------------------------------------------|-----------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------|
| June 2018 | | Quick link to webcast: https://north-ayrshire.public-i.tv/core/portal/webcast_interactive/354785 |
| | Councillor Murdoch to Cabinet Member for the Economy | “Why is it necessary to have an Environmental Impact Assessment (EIA) for the proposed development at the Arran Ferry Terminal within Ardrossan Harbour and not for the Oil Rig Decommissioning Yard at Hunterston?” |
| | Councillor Murdoch to Cabinet Member for the Economy | Supplementary Q "An Environmental Impact Assessment was not considered necessary for the creation of the Caisson Gate and other work to the Hunterston Basin as each individual oil rig would require both a decommissioning statement and an EIA. Does this mean that work to the basin for which planning permission has now been granted, cannot commence until the first oil rig has been through this process and an EIA produced for the entire process?" |
| | Councillor Murdoch to Cabinet Member for the Economy | Supplementary Q, Councillor Murdoch asked whether the Cabinet Member had no concerns over the lack of an EIA and if he was confident that the due process had been followed in the correct manner. |
| | | NB: Supplementary questions circulated in writing to planning department after the meeting – written replies available from Councillor Murdoch 1. Section 12 of the Guidance Notes for the Petroleum Act 1998 sets down in law the environmental protections and regulations necessary for the decommissioning of oil and gas platforms. |

| | | |
|----------------------|-------------------------------------------------------|--------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------|
| | | <ol style="list-style-type: none"> 2. Sections 12.1 to 12.5 clearly state that an Environmental Impact Assessment (EIA) MUST be provided and available in draft form for public consultation and in final form for any planning application. 3. Section 12.9 refers to decommissioning that they may take place "close to shore" clearly establishing that section 12 covers decommissioning in any geographical marine situation - such as Hunterston Basin. (It has been argued that section 12 only applies to decommissioning far out at sea and / or beyond the 12mile limit. 4. It has been stated that an EIA will be provided in future for each individual oil rig. This would seem to be contradicted by NAC's own planning documentation. Agenda Item 3.3 for the Planning Committee Meeting of 25th April 2018, states the following: "An EIA screening request was submitted on February 2017 where it was determined that an EIA was not required for 'DECOMMISSIONING', erection of caisson gates or the extension to the quay". Does this confirm NAC's formal position that an EIA will not be required or enforceable for any aspect of future decommissioning at Hunterston? 5. Section 12 as outlined above was published after the NAC screening opinion of 2017 but before Planning Permission was granted in April 2018. Why was the earlier screening opinion not revisited in the light of this important new legislation? 6. It has now been confirmed that the Scottish Natural Heritage Pre Screening Consultation Response that was attached to Marine Scotland's letter to EnviroCentre of 13th June 2017, is not on file and cannot be found. This means it could not have been read by Planners. How were the Planners able to arrive at a favourable Screening Opinion with this absolutely critical and fundamental information missing? |
| December 2018 | | Quick link to webcast: https://north-ayrshire.public-i.tv/core/portal/webcast_interactive/387173 |
| | Councillor Murdoch to Chair of the Planning Committee | <p>“Councillor Robert Barr and I were nominated and sanctioned by the Full North Ayrshire Council to represent them at the new Liaison Committee for the Oil Rig Decommissioning site at Hunterston. I believe that this was a planning condition and as such had a time limit for arranging and conducting the first meeting. I believe that the time limit was within three months. Can you please let me know if this is the case and if there has been a breach of planning conditions?”</p> |

| | | |
|----------------------|-------------------------------------------------------|---------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------|
| | Councillor Murdoch to Chair of the Planning Committee | Supplementary Q Councillor Murdoch asked if the Chair of the Planning Committee agreed with him that the liaison committee should have met by now; when the liaison committee would hold its first meeting; and why it had taken so long for Councillor Murdoch to receive a written response to his repeated enquiries on this matter |
| | | “At the last Planning Committee meeting held on Wednesday 5th December, Ms Rita Holmes, Chair of Fairlie Community Council was mentioned in part of a discussion regarding the Hunterston Decommissioning Site. Can you confirm in what context was her name mentioned and why considering she was present at the meeting was she not allowed to answer on her own behalf.” |
| February 2019 | | Quick link to webcast: https://north-ayrshire.public-i.tv/core/portal/webcast_interactive/399511 |
| | Councillor Murdoch to Chair of the Planning Committee | "What dialogue have NAC had regarding the Liaison Committee for the Oil Rig Decommissioning Site at Hunterston since the last Full Council meeting in December?" |
| | Councillor Murdoch to Chair of the Planning Committee | Supplementary question, Councillor Murdoch asked why, if there was no operator for the site, the Scottish Enterprise had allocated £10m to the project and what conditions were attached to the funding. Councillor Murdoch further asked about the identity of the company Cesscon Decom and why the company had produced a video illustrating what it intended to do with the site. |
| | Councillor Murdoch to Chair of the Planning Committee | “Why are Largs and Skelmorlie Community Councils not included in the Liaison Committee for the Oil Rig Decommissioning Site at Hunterston?” |

| | | |
|-------------------|-------------------------------------------------------|------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------|
| | Councillor Murdoch to Chair of the Planning Committee | As a supplementary question, Councillor Murdoch asked about the Council's expectations of the liaison committee and why Largs and Skelmolie Community Councils had now been included. |
| | Councillor Murdoch to Cabinet Member for the Economy | “Will the promotion and operation of tourism be affected by the Oil Rig Decommissioning Site at Hunterston and the operation of industry within Hunterston Park?” Supplementary question, Councillor Murdoch asked whether the Council was concerned about headlines in the Times Newspaper dated 21 April 2018 about the adverse impact on tourism of oil rig decommissioning in Cromarty. |
| March 2019 | | Quick link to webcast: https://north-ayrshire.public-i.tv/core/portal/webcast_interactive/408457 |
| | Councillor Murdoch to Cabinet Member for the Economy | “Before planning permission was granted for the Decommissioning Site at the Marine Construction Yard at Hunterston in 2018, were all meetings held between North Ayrshire Council, Scottish Natural Heritage, Scottish Environmental Protection Agency and Marine Scotland minuted and if not why not?” |
| | Councillor Murdoch to Cabinet Member for the Economy | A supplementary question, Councillor Murdoch asked whether the Cabinet Member agreed that future meetings between officers and outside organisations should be minuted. |
| | Councillor Murdoch to Cabinet Member for the Economy | “If the proposal is successful, how many jobs will be created at the Decommissioning Site at the Marine Construction Yard at Hunterston?” |
| | Councillor Murdoch to | As a supplementary question, Councillor Murdoch made reference to varying figures quoted by |

| | | |
|--|-------------------------------------------------------|------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------|
| | Cabinet Member for the Economy | Kenneth Gibson MSP with regard to the number of jobs likely to be created by the decommissioning work, contrasting the MSP's estimates of '100s of jobs' and up to 1,000 jobs with the 40-80 jobs associated with similar facilities elsewhere, and asked the Cabinet Member for clarification as to the correct figure. |
| | Councillor Murdoch to Chair of the Planning Committee | "In documentation obtained through Freedom of Information relating to the Hunterston Marine Construction Yard, there is a letter from the Enviro Centre dated 10th January 2018 sent to North Ayrshire's Planning Department. Is the Chair of Planning aware of the existence of this letter and if so when did he become aware of it?" |
| | Councillor Murdoch to Chair of the Planning Committee | A supplementary question, Councillor Murdoch made reference to a Freedom of Information request which had revealed both Marine Scotland and Scottish Natural Heritage had encouraged the Council to conduct a full Environmental Impact Assessment, and asked whether the Planning Committee was made aware of this prior to granting planning permission. |
| | Councillor Murdoch to Chair of the Planning Committee | "Was there a reply sent to the letter dated the 10th January 2018 from the Enviro Centre to North Ayrshire's Planning Department in respect of the Hunterston Marine Construction Yard and why is there no reference in the formal planning report provided to the Planning Committee?" |
| | Councillor Murdoch to Chair of the Planning Committee | As a supplementary question, Councillor Murdoch referred to statements made in the Scottish Parliament that there had been substantial changes to the project since Marine Scotland's original assessment that an Environmental Impact Assessment was not necessary, and asked the Chair of Planning about the nature of those substantial changes. |
| | Councillor Murdoch to Chair of the | "In the letter from the Enviro Centre to North Ayrshire Council Planning dated 10th January 2018 the first paragraph states "As you are aware we submitted an Environmental Review with |

| | | |
|------------------|-------------------------------------------------------|----------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------|
| | Planning Committee | <p>our screening request of 20 February 2017. This Environmental Review discussed the potential environmental effects of the development as a whole as agreed in our site meeting of January 2017. Subsequently, as fully discussed with North Ayrshire Council (McInally Associates/NAC) it was considered that the most appropriate approach to making the necessary changes to the Hunterston Marine Construction Yard was through three separate planning applications (and a Marine Licence from Marine Scotland)."</p> <p>Who attended that site meeting, was it minuted and who proposed lodging the application in three parts?"</p> |
| | Councillor Murdoch to Chair of the Planning Committee | <p>"During the Full Council Meeting held on Wednesday 27th March while answering one of my questions, the Chair of Planning referred to a letter dated 19th February 2019 from the Scottish Government. This letter was also referred to during a Public Meeting held in Largs Campus on 21st February 2019. Is the Chair of Planning and NAC still "quite happy with the written comment from the Scottish Government"?"</p> |
| | Councillor Murdoch to Chair of the Planning Committee | <p>A supplementary question, Councillor Murdoch asked for the Chair of the Planning Committee's response to the fact that a constituent had written to the Scottish Government to ask for details of this meeting and had been advised that "there was no meeting" and "there were no discussions".</p> |
| June 2019 | | Quick link to webcast: https://north-ayrshire.public-i.tv/core/portal/webcast_interactive/424384 |
| | Councillor Murdoch to Chair of the Planning Committee | <p>"Can the Chair of Planning confirm that no councillor or officer at North Ayrshire Council suggested that the Oil Rig Decommissioning Planning application should be lodged in three parts?"</p> |
| | Councillor Murdoch to Chair of the | <p>As a supplementary question, Councillor Murdoch asked why, if he was not clear who had proposed lodging three applications, Councillor Marshall had claimed the idea as his own while</p> |

| | | |
|--|-----------------------|--------------------------------------------|
| | Planning Committee | at a meeting of Fairlie Community Council. |
| | | |